

**BENEFIT MONITORING AND EVALUATION
OF BASIC EDUCATION PROJECT
ON MADRASAH IBTIDAIYAH AND MADRASAH TSANAWIYAH**

**(Monitoring dan Evaluasi tentang Manfaat Proyek Pendidikan Dasar
pada Madrasah Ibtidaiyah dan Madrasah Tsanawiyah)**

oleh : Pudji Muljono

Abstrak

Sampai akhir tahun 2001, Proyek Pendidikan Dasar yang didukung pendanaannya oleh Asian Development Bank (ADB) telah mendistribusikan berbagai jenis bantuan kepada 5210 madrasah yang berlokasi di 16 kabupaten sasaran di Indonesia. Pengelola proyek telah memberikan fasilitas, peralatan, bahan instruksional, pelatihan guru dan pemberian beasiswa kepada madrasah sasaran. Studi ini antara lain bertujuan untuk mengetahui sejauh mana manfaat dan perbaikan kinerja dan profil madrasah yang menjadi sasaran proyek tersebut berdasarkan indikator awal yang telah ditetapkan proyek. Berdasarkan hasil monitoring dan evaluasi yang dilakukan ternyata diketahui bahwa bantuan yang diberikan berdampak positif bagi madrasah, siswa, guru serta pengelola madrasah.

Kata kunci : monitoring dan evaluasi, proyek pendidikan dasar, madrasah

Abstract

Up to the end of FY 2001, Basic Education Project (BEP) by Asian Development Bank as the financing agency, had distributed various inputs to 5210 madrasahs located in 16 districts of BEP target. The project manajement has delivered the inputs of facilities, equipment, instructional materials, teacher training and scholarships to the target madrasah. This study is designed to answer the questions as to extent inputs have reached the schools and determine if there are any observable benefits or improvements in the target schools' profile and performance. Based on the result of the monitoring and evaluation, the BEP inputs have positive impact on madrasah, student, teacher and the madrasah manajement.

Keywords : monitoring and evaluation, basic education project, madrasah

1. Introduction

1.1 Background

The primary objective of the Basic Education Project (BEP) ADB Loan No. 1442 – INO is to upgrade the academic qualification of madrasah (Tsanawiyah and Ibtidaiyah) in 16 districts/municipalities within six provinces (the provinces of Lampung, West Java, Central Java, East Java, West Nusa Tenggara and South Kalimantan) to be able to administer education of high quality in lines with the Government efforts for providing compulsory education for school-aged children. The strategy for its development is the provision/improvement of crucial inputs, which include new construction and refurbishing of school facilities, furniture, and equipment, scholarship for disabled students, teachers training and staff development to support the effective learning and efficient management of madrasah as well. Out of the madrasahs, both public and private Madrasah Ibtidaiyah (MI)

and Madrasah Tsanawiyah (MTs) receiving the project Support, there are 39 public madrasah Models (24 public madrasah Ibtidaiyah-MIN, and 15 public madrasah Tsanawiyah-MTsN) have been established to be receiving more intensive support. A Common Learning Resources Center (CLRC) is also constructed in each of the MTsN models.

The Basic Education Project Benefit Monitoring and Evaluation (BEP-BME) is established for monitoring all the above stated inputs, primary indicators set forth and benchmark of progress and for evaluating the outputs and outcomes of the project. The results of this activity can be used as the indication of BEP progress and success.

This study is specially required by the BEP Executing Agency (EA) and Asian Development Bank as the financing agency, as a means of determining the extent to which the Basic Education Project (BEP) management has delivered the inputs of facilities, equipment, instructional materials, teacher training and scholarships have been delivered to the Madrasah in 16 districts in six provinces targeted for assistance and development. At the same time the BEP is required to track or monitor the extent to which these schools are showing improvements as measured by identified baseline indicators.

1.2 Objective

This study is designed to answer the questions as to the extent inputs have reached the schools and determine if there are any observable benefits or improvements in the target schools' profile and performance. Three specific objectives are set as follows :

- (1) to know the extent to which the Basic Education Project (BEP) management has delivered the inputs of facilities, equipment, instructional materials, teacher training and scholarships to the target Madrasah (Ibtidaiyah-MI and Tsanawiyah-MTs).
- (2) to monitor the progress to which these schools are showing improvement as measured by identified baseline indicators.
- (3) to answer the questions as to the extent inputs have reached the schools and determine if there are any observable benefits or improvements in the target schools' profiles and performance.

2. Methodology

The approach used in conducting program of education quality improvement, particularly Basic Education Project (BEP) is a system approach. By this approach, monitoring and benefit progress evaluation can be done comprehensively, collectively and suitable to measure progress and evaluate the achievement, especially project objective.

In addition, participation approach is also taken into account to ensure that the project's sustainability in monitoring and benefit progress evaluation of the project. Participation of the actor/stakeholder, particularly Kandepag (District Office of the Ministry of Religious Affairs = MORA) as the main actor in monitoring and evaluation, Kanwil Depag (Provincial Office of MORA), and MORA, in entire activity is essential.

Monitoring and evaluation activity should be observed as a dynamic process. The result of project monitoring and evaluation should be used for repeating the process in the next periods.

This study is based upon data and information from four sources: (1) the Ministry of Religious Affairs (MORA) Educational Management Information System (EMIS); (2) a BME database designed to track input from the Central Project Implementation Unit (CPIU) and/or the six BEP Provincial Project Implementation Units (PPIU) to the approximately 5210 schools sites in 16 districts targeted to receive BEP assistance; (3) reports on BEP inputs FY 2001 distributions verification, BEP qualitative output and impact, and reports on the perceptions of BEP personnel at provincial and district levels and madrasahs stake holders as to the impact of BEP on madrasah quality improvement and (4) BEP-BME Annual Report 2000 (Final Report of First Stage BEP-BME Periodic Survey).

3. Finding and Discussions

Up to the end of FY 2001, BEP had distributed various inputs to 5210 madrasahs (152 public MI, 3119 private MI, 133 Public MTs, and 1806 private MTs) located in 16 districts of BEP target. The most extensive assistance provided by BEP was for domestic training and the less was equipment provision. Some training and instructional material assistance were also distributed to other original BEP target area madrasahs.

The civil works assistance had been executed most properly to private madrasahs through Assistance Scheme for Facilities Improvement (ASFI). The number of schools receiving ASFI increased significantly during the last three years of BEP implementation, i.e. 302 in FY 99/00, 1387 in FY 2000 and 2025 in FY 2001. The local community was very enthusiastic on ASFI assistance and they suggest extending the scope of this particular assistance.

1. Achievement of Performance Indicators

BEP assistance impact indicators was grouped into seven components, i.e. (1) general impact, (2) improvement of learning facilities and infrastructure, (3) performance of students, teacher, and staff, (4) teaching learning process, (5) school administration and management, (6) policy, rules and regulation, and (7) institutional interrelationship.

The most important of BEP impact is upon the increasing of staff/teacher motivation. During BEP implementation from 1999-2001, the motivation of principals and teachers can be highly maintained. The reason of highly motivation achievement are 1) better facility, 2) teaching confidence, 3) better knowledge of teaching learning process and 4) better academic atmosphere.

Generally, the enrolment of public MI and public MTs has increased about 9.2% from 1998/1999 to 2001/2002 or 48931 students while the enrolment for SD/SLTP increased only 6.3 %. However, from 2000/2001 to 2001/2002 the number of enrolment of private MTs in six provinces tends to be unchanged. The enrollment of students in model madrasah slightly decreases about 0.66%, especially in Lampung, West Java and South Kalimantan in year 2000/2001, there was a fact that the NEM gap between two types of schools (SLTP and MTs) has been narrowed. The gap of NEM score between SD and MI was decreased from 5.05 to 2.38, during the past four year period (1997/1998 — 2000/2001).

Average NEM score of MTs and MI in BEP target district were not significantly

difference with those in non-BEP target district. Average class size in BEP target area is higher than that in non-BEP target area.

The madrasah model's grade is going up from 1998/1999 to 2000/2001. At provincial level, number of model madrasah with increased rank was 22 or 56.4% which was higher than ones with decreased rank (17).

Nevertheless, MI model's rank was different with MTs model's rank. In district level, number of MI with increased rank was higher than ones decreased rank. However, at provincial level, the condition was reversed.

BEP project give a significant impact on teacher qualification, especially for MI. Percentage number of MI teacher with good qualification in target district is over 80%. Whereas, that ones in non-BEP project is around 35%. Nevertheless for the MTs, there is still needed a support for staff improvement.

Generally, BEP project give an impact on facilities development. Classroom condition in district target is 25% better compared with the condition in non BEP target for both MTs and MI. This fact is also occurred for classroom renovation and construction.

Based on the data in academic year 2001/2002, even in overall the impact of BEP project in madrasah accreditation status was not significant, in East Java, percentage of madrasah in target district that accredited are about two times compare with one in non-BEP target. This fact is occurred for both MTs and MI.

The BEP inputs have positive impacts on madrasah popularity, i.e., maintaining or increasing enrollment of new students and strengthening school capacity. In fact, BEP inputs received by madrasahs were also beneficial in producing better quality graduates, compared to other madrasahs, which did not receive BEP inputs. Moreover, model madrasahs had improved better than non-model madrasahs. Model MTs had been improved better than model MI. Some of model madrasah even got the best rank for NEM score in their districts. This study recommends that institutions and persons concerned should make sustainable and continuing efforts for such improvement. Madrasah principal's managerial skill supporting these improvements should be continually directed toward performance development of madrasahs, particularly for the model madrasahs.

2. Community Participation and Role of Key Public Figures

Key public figure played an important role in madrasah development. They promoted and evaluated the madrasah directly and indirectly through informal meeting with the local community. Consequently, the local community was always involved in the development of madrasah, especially in the physical involvement. In evidence, they came to schools to build or renovate the building without asking for being paid. The BEP intervention had been stimulating the local community to do better working bee, because they realized that the benefit of this assistance was very significant upon the performance of madrasahs. The achievements of BEP ASFI form had been enlarged and even exceeded the physical target. These kinds of assistance are more preferred because this system stimulated the community to do better responsibility to the

madrasah.

On the other hand, there was public opinion that madrasah as a type of education system would be less competitive than public schools under MONE, so it might reduce parent's enthusiasm to enroll their children to the madrasahs. Indeed, this study mentioned that it is essential to provide sustainable efforts in improving and socializing madrasah education system in order to achieve high quality of education. However, most of them also believed that for their children future in the globalization era, they must have the knowledge of science and technology as good as the knowledge of religion. If two area of knowledge are combined they believe that their children will become a good quality of human resources.

In another case, converting private madrasah into public madrasah should be taken carefully, otherwise the community participation will decrease in madrasah development. The local community stated that the responsibility of public madrasah is belonged to government, however, they convinced that private madrasah development is local community responsibility.

The key public figures agreed that BEP assistance had good impacts to the performance of the school, because they always watch the development of madrasah, staff motivation, quality of teaching and also they build the networking.

3. Quality Improvement for Teaching & Learning Process

a. Library

In general, the existing libraries condition was needed to be improved. Most of these libraries were not equipped with sufficient book collection, professional librarian, and sufficient library rooms/space. As many as 1230884 books for library collection, 2887746 handbooks for teachers and 3507060 supporting books had been distributed.

The role of a library as an important resource center for study and knowledge enrichment was not fully met yet. It needs better book collection and better management. A substantial number of madrasahs did not have any library yet. The book collections of the existing libraries were very few and less skill librarians. Assistance for provision of suitable and adequate number of books, added with well-trained librarians would be beneficial for the madrasahs performance.

After BEP intervention, most of madrasahs have received many books to be used both by teachers and students for supporting teaching and learning process. But their topics/titles need to be reconsidered for accommodating the dynamic change and local needs. The provincial and district offices of MORA should be proactive in providing the title and contents of the books to CPIU. Even though, the direction and rules of books utilization have been already clear from the government (BEP), however the implementation at the school need to be improved. The students should have more chance to read books both at home and at school.

The training organized for librarians had effectively improved the capabilities and competencies as well as the performance of the librarians in serving to the teachers and

students. The performance madrasah libraries, at which the librarian had been trained, were improved, better maintained and proper operating. The principals should always monitor, evaluate and also direct the librarian to do better management of the library. This study proposes to continue and extend coverage of refurbishment including new library rooms and furniture procurement for libraries in madrasahs.

b. Laboratory

The laboratories in madrasahs were commonly used in several shifts. These laboratories were also poorly furnished and equipment, so that the madrasahs could not carry out laboratory practices perfectly due to the lack of facilities. Assistance for laboratory facilities and civil works found to be very beneficial for madrasahs.

The laboratory equipment, especially in the model madrasah was well set up and used by students based on the schedule. This study suggested that in the near future, assistance provided to madrasahs could be extended both in quantities and distribution. The other improvement needed to increase madrasahs quality is the continuing education of laboratory technician and related teacher training. In addition, well-prepared schedule and maintenance are required for better management of laboratories.

c. Staff Development

Another promising fact found by this study, that staff development both overseas and domestic training were effective in improving competencies and capabilities of the staff in teaching program. Some of the staff trained were participated in internship and in-service training organized within madrasahs. A substantial number of the staff performed very well in their subject after further training. On the other hand, several staff returning from the training did not work back on their origin madrasahs, but they moved and worked in other madrasahs, even in the other better schools or other institutions. In different case, it was found that the returnees work in madrasah under limited task or teaching hours. Indeed, for avoiding such inefficiency in the future, staff who would be sent for training should have a legal contract with their schools. By applying this contract, staff returning from training must return to the previous madrasah at which they have been working at least for certain period of time to implement their knowledge which gained from the education and training.

Future staff development program both overseas and domestic requires further review and improvement on the step of recruitment of participants, instructor selection and organizing institutions as well. For one or two-year overseas training should be followed by reentry matriculation program for assisting the trainees in adapting with college and local culture and peer learning. The post education or training should be conducted in form of communication forum of participants to share the implementation and further development.

d. Teaching Methodology, Curriculum and Instructional Material

Most of the teachers who had been trained either overseas or domestic have

implemented a good teaching methodology. The capability of some teachers were increased after training, because the better preparation and teaching technique. This caused a better atmosphere of learning process. Not only in the teaching methodology, the trained teachers have better skill in curriculum design. Some of them in some of the madrasahs have socialized the training results to the other teachers in order to have the same perception in teaching methodologies. However, curriculum development also requires the establishment of curriculum review and development committee to provide periodic evaluation as well as improvement.

The implementation of 1994 curriculum has been positively changed every year. The madrasah who implement 60-90% of that curriculum become lower, on the contrary, the madrasah who implement 90% or above of that curriculum become higher. It means that most of the madrasah have applied the 1994 curriculum.

Instructional materials assistance sometimes did not meet the needs of the madrasahs and the quality of these materials needs to be improved. It was found that there were madrasahs receiving books, which did not meet the students needs in terms of topics contained. Thus, to be more effective, this study suggests providing appropriate instructional materials, which could meet the needs of the madrasahs in terms of types of book, quantity as well as quality of the books. The first step to do that is the proposal should come from the local madrasah. The fact finding investigated that different instructional materials (books, audiovisual in model madrasah) were distributed by different contractors. For reliable supervision, to be more professional and to allow complaints resolution for incorrect distribution of assistance, each of contractors must have a clear coordination with Provincial and District Offices of MORA.

e. School Management

School management was a factor in maintaining and improving performance of madrasahs. There were many managerial factors evaluated, which affected the quality of madrasahs education systems. The education administrators particularly the principals were playing an important role in improving educational quality of the madrasahs. Besides that, for private schools, the role of BP3 and the foundation were very significant in supporting the performance of management. Thus, there was a need to continue training activities in school administration and management for the appropriate staff. Since only a few madrasah especially MI which have administrative staff, this study recommends that madrasahs should recruit administrative staff. In addition, it seemed so essential to fully implement the school-based management to allow madrasahs administrate their education independently, more efficiently and more professionally.

f. Common Learning Resource Center (CLRC)

The Common Learning Resources Centers (CLRC) have been used for training of various subjects: such as sciences, social study, mathematics and other subjects. The CLRC has also been used to facilitate teaching and learning process in madrasahs. However this study found that the standard operating procedure for maintenance and management should be improved for smooth running and sustainability of CLRC. For their sustainability of maintenance and optimal utilization some madrasahs permitted

the other institution like Pemda to occupy the CLRC for the training or meeting. They rent the place for madrasah income generating activities.

4. Improving Accessibility to Basic Education

a. Quality and Quantity of Madrasah Facilities

A substantial number of madrasahs did not have adequate quality and quantity of educational facilities. For this reason supports from the Government and other parties concerned with madrasah education would be very helpful. This study found that model MTs can only accommodate 65 — 85% of enrolled new students. New classrooms are needed to accept more students. In addition, many madrasahs hoped that the assistance to be provided is in better quality. If possible, the targeted madrasahs could propose inputs specification and involve in supervision for the distribution of such assistance. However, most of the madrasahs were too enthusiastic on receiving any of assistance hence little concern of the quality and quantity. To solve these problems, District and Provincial Offices, PPIU and CPIU may intervene directly by closely supervising especially in step of delivering and SOP set up for avoiding unnecessary distribution deviation.

b. Procurement

The distribution of assistance should be on schedule as stated at project implementation plan (P0). District officers should also supervise this distribution, particularly for remote areas (limited transportation and communication facilities). For civil works assistance, the period for assistance realization was pretty short and caused the time for an appropriate site preparation was insufficient. This situation was worsening by higher unit cost of materials and local workers wages than in proposal drawn. Due to this problem, some constructions of civil works in remote area were found in low quality, especially during the economic crisis.

Procurement of laboratory equipment had been done appropriately, even though there was some of the below standard furniture. However, the operations of the laboratory equipment in the madrasah should be intensified and provided with operation and maintenance manual. The principals was suggested to appoint the staff who responsible for the utilization and maintenance.

5. Institutional Capacity Building

a. Implementation of Models MI and MTs

Model madrasah with its BEP advantages becomes more popular in surrounding community. Especially in MTs, BEP assistance has significantly increased the number of student candidates to enroll to those madrasahs. Only 65-85% of incoming students were accepted, due to the capacity limitation. On the average, incoming students increase 10% per year. Nevertheless, for some Model MI, because of the location adjacent to other schools, student's distribution, limited school age children, the acceptance level were still high (85— 100%).

Initial conditions of model madrasahs were different among locations, hence evaluation of model madrasahs' performance still vary in the range of average to good. To support madrasahs quality improvement, it is necessary to use BEP granted facilities optimally. Optimal usage can be achieved when experienced principals lead the madrasah, supported by appropriate guidance on facility management. For this reason, this study recommends to set up Guidance for Madrasah Model Facility management.

The spirit of model madrasah as the agent of education quality process improvement should be improved. For this reason, it is suggested to create model madrasah from private MI or MTs, without changing their status from private to public. Private model madrasah criteria, replication and adjustment procedures, and funding alternative need further in-depth study. Benchmark of madrasah model to the better quality/rank of public or private madrasah in or at other province is recommended to be done.

b. Regional Project Coordination

Kandepag and Kanwil had been structurally involved in the assistance operation starting from planning, organizing, implementation and evaluation, so structural coordination can be conducted. District Advisory Committee (DAC) and Provincial Advisory Committee (PAC) had participated especially in planning, monitoring and evaluation. At present, Kandep and Kanwil officer involved in monitoring activity incidentally. In moderate intensity, two way communications between madrasah and Kandep, PPIU and Kanwil in BEP implementation had been conducted. This is an improvement from the previous year.

This study recommends Kandepag should involve officially in assistance implementation, from planning, organizing, and execution up to supervision. The intensity of structural coordination should be better, especially with the DAC and PAC. Coordination and synchronization between CPIU, PPIU, Kanwil and Kandepag will be done much easier within structural authority. In this arrangement, Kandepag will direct more and clearer in giving suggestion, input and guidance, or even being warning call to the implementing officer in the field.

c. Information Systems

The establishment of information system was found beneficial for BEP implementation. EMIS, which has been developed and adopted since 1997/1998, had been gradually used successfully in the BEP and in the development of other madrasahs. The validity of comprehensive data needs continuous improvement. EMIS requires sustainable socialization up to District level. The EMIS also requires extension in District and Provincial levels. Considering optimal data tabulation process for producing information, which is useful for those concerned, a distribution and financial information system of BEP inputs have been develop to back up monitoring and evaluation for future phased planning and implementation.

To improve the usage level of newly constructed information system; this study recommends socialization process of the system usage, upgrading application program and continuous data updating for Education Management Information System, BEP Assistance Distribution Information System, and BEP Financial Information System.

6. Supporting Project Implementation

a. Improving the Capacity for Project Implementation

Capability of project management in all line from CPIU, PPIU, Kanwil and Kandep was found strengthening along with the BEP project existence. Nevertheless, technical capability of project administration, planning and reporting still needs to be improved. To accommodate madrasah specific requirements, determination of assistance functions and allocation should use bottom-up approach. Guidance program and on-the-job training in madrasah program development for school principals would be helpful. The key factor is communication between MORA and the madrasahs should be well run.

In the frame of madrasah-based management empowerment toward better independence, this study recommends involvement of students' parents, local government and local key public figures as madrasah stakeholder. With government funding limitation in financing basic education sector, madrasah has to find out the solution especially in operational financing aspects by applying school-based management in utilizing local potential resources. Empowerment of local community to establish development needs must be accommodated in line with local government autonomy program.

b. Implementing Project Monitoring and Evaluation

Monitoring and Evaluation are two important activities in project. Tools for routine monitoring of BEP assistance developed by this study can be used by the project, Kandep and Kanwil staff. To control the realization of assistance distribution in detail, it is necessary to strengthen quantity and quality of monitoring and evaluation. Each distributed assistance needs to be monitored three times even more, which are pre, on going and post-assistance, especially for civil works. Kandep and Kanwil officer have to conduct more intensive on-the-spot checking. The two-ways communication among madrasah and Kandep, PPIU and Kanwil must be done constantly in the implementation of BEP assistance. Result of monitoring and evaluation should be reported and submitted regularly to program and policy planner at Kandep, Kanwil and Central level and also implemented in the next project for better performance. For assuring better project implementation, project benefit monitoring and evaluation should be conducted annually, and in progress project monitoring and evaluation should be conducted frequently, in the right time in line with a good planning.

7. Institutional Inter—relationship

BEP activities have mostly stimulated the development of the madrasahs. BEP activities had improved or even created new professional networks in the madrasah quality improvements. Most institution and resource persons participated in the BEP activities were willing to involve formally or informally in the similar activities in the future even if the BEP has been completed. Resources of some institution, such as library or

laboratory can be used by madrasah teachers and students in the teaching and learning activities. These will contribute to the improvement of madrasah stakeholders' motivation to improve the popularity and quality of the madrasahs.

For the better future madrasah development program, the link and network among madrasah principals, teachers, alumni, and all related parties should be more intensified. These networks are expected to create a new and better condition of madrasah as one of basic Education Institution in Indonesia. The development of madrasahs have been started by establishing some forums, such as BP3 communication forum, KKM, training alumni forum. The sustainability of these forums should be controlled by local MORA. The budget for these activities may be taken through the routine budget of MORA or self funding.

4. Conclusion

BEP assistance distribution, in general, was well executed. However, some of the assistance was found not really suitable with the requirement. For instance, some madrasah sent their teachers to administration training even though they were not administration staff. The reason was because they did not have administration staff. To prevent such undesirable difficulties, monitoring and supervision should be done systematically.

This study found that BEP assistance has given positive impact to the students and teachers, especially in providing books, librarian training and establishment library rooms. Madrasahs received BEP books' assistance for library collection that supports the teaching learning process. To accommodate the dynamic requirements the variety and types of the books need to be periodically evaluated.

Generally, madrasahs have insufficient laboratory facilities, which causing limited practice session. Regarding with this condition, madrasahs have received laboratory facilities and room establishment to increase the skills of practices. In the future, this assistance is still needed and distributed gradually to more madrasahs.

References

- Marimin, et. al. *Final Report of Periodic Survey: Basic Education Project Benefit Monitoring and Evaluation FY 2000 and 2001 (BEP-BME)*. Bogor: FAT-BAU, 2002.
- Marimin, et. al. *Final Report of First Stage BEP-BME Periodic Survey: Annual Report 2000*. Bogor: FAT-BAU, 2001.
- The Ministry of Religious Affairs (MORA). *Report on BEP Inputs FY 2001 : Distribution verification, Qualitative Output and Impact*. Jakarta: MORA, 2002.
- The Ministry of Religious Affairs (MORA). *Educational Management Information System (EMIS)*. Jakarta: MORA, 2002.